

DEP INFORMATION SHEET

Appeals to the Board of Environmental Protection

Date: November 2024 Contact: Clerk.BEP@maine.gov or

(207) 314-1458

SUMMARY

This document provides information regarding a person's rights and obligations in filing an administrative or judicial appeal of: (1) a final license decision made by the Commissioner of the Department of Environmental Protection ("DEP"); or (2) an insurance claim-related decision ("Clean-up and Response Fund decision") made by the Commissioner or the Office of State Fire Marshal pursuant to 38 M.R.S. § 568-A.

Except as explained below, there are two methods available to an aggrieved person seeking to appeal a license decision made by the Commissioner or a Clean-up and Response Fund decision: (1) an administrative appeal before the Board of Environmental Protection ("Board"); or (2) a judicial appeal before Maine's Superior Court. An aggrieved person seeking review of a license decision or Clean-up and Response Fund decision made by the Board may seek judicial review in Maine's Superior Court.

An appeal of a license decision made by the DEP Commissioner or the Board regarding an application for an expedited wind energy development (35-A M.R.S. § 3451(4)), a general permit for an offshore wind energy demonstration project (38 M.R.S. § 480-HH(1)), or a general permit for a tidal energy demonstration project (38 M.R.S. § 636-A) must be taken to the Supreme Judicial Court sitting as the Law Court.

I. ADMINISTRATIVE APPEALS TO THE BOARD

LEGAL REFERENCES

A person filing an appeal with the Board should review the applicable rules and statutes, including the DEP's Chapter 2 rule, *Processing of Applications and Other Administrative Matters* (06-096 C.M.R. ch. 2); Organization and Powers, 38 M.R.S. §§ 341-D(4) and 346; and the Maine Administrative Procedure Act, 5 M.R.S. § 11001.

DEADLINE TO SUBMIT AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD

Within 30 calendar days of the date of: (1) a final license decision of the Commissioner; or (2) a Clean-up and Response Fund decision, an aggrieved person may appeal to the Board for review of that decision. "Aggrieved person" means any person whom the Board determines may suffer a particularized injury as a result of a Commissioner's license decision or a Clean-up and Response Fund decision. A complete appeal must be received by the Board no later than 5:00 p.m. on the 30th calendar day of the decision being appealed. With limited exception, untimely appeals will be dismissed.

HOW TO SUBMIT AN APPEAL TO THE BOARD

An appeal to the Board may be submitted via postal mail or electronic mail (e-mail) and must contain all signatures and required appeal contents. An electronic filing must contain the scanned original signature of the appealant(s). The appeal documents must be sent to the following address.

Chair, Board of Environmental Protection c/o Board Clerk 17 State House Station Augusta, ME 04333-0017 Clerk.BEP@maine.gov The DEP may also request the submittal of the original signed paper appeal documents when the appeal is filed electronically. The risk of material not being received in a timely manner is on the sender, regardless of the method used.

At the time an appeal is filed with the Board, the appellant must send a copy of the appeal to: (1) the Commissioner of the DEP (Maine Department of Environmental Protection, 17 State House Station, Augusta, Maine 04333-0017); (2) the licensee, if the appellant is not the licensee; and (3) if a hearing was held on the application, any intervenors in that hearing proceeding. For appeals of Clean-up and Response Fund decisions made by the State Fire Marshal, the appellant must also send a copy of the appeal to the State Fire Marshal. Please contact the Board Clerk at clerk.bep@maine.gov or DEP staff at 207-287-7688 with questions or for contact information regarding a specific license or Clean-up and Response Fund decision.

REQUIRED APPEAL CONTENTS

A written appeal must contain the information specified in Chapter 2, section 23(B) or section 24(B), as applicable, at the time the appeal is submitted. Please carefully review these sections of Chapter 2, which is available online at https://www.maine.gov/sos/cec/rules/06/chaps06.htm, or contact the Board Clerk to obtain a copy of the rule. Failure to comply with the content of appeal requirements may result in the appeal being dismissed pursuant to Chapter 2, section 23(C) or section 24(C).

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS IN APPEALING A DECISION TO THE BOARD

- 1. *Be familiar with the administrative record.* Generally, the record on which the Board decides an appeal is limited to the record prepared by the agency in its review of the application, any supplemental evidence admitted to the record by the Board Chair and, if a hearing is held on the appeal, additional evidence admitted during the hearing. A person who seeks to appeal a decision to the Board is encouraged to contact the DEP (or State Fire Marshal for Clean-up and Response Fund decisions made by that agency) to inspect the record before filing an appeal.
- 2. Be familiar with the applicable rules and laws. An appellant is required to identify the licensing criterion or standard the appellant believes was not satisfied in issuing the decision, the bases of the objections or challenges, and the remedy sought. Prior to filing an appeal, review the decision being appealed to identify the rules and laws that are applicable to the decision. An appellant may contact the DEP or Board staff with any questions regarding the applicable rules and laws or the appeal procedure generally.
- 3. The filing of an appeal does not operate as a stay to any decision. If a license has been granted and it has been appealed, the license normally remains in effect pending the processing of the appeal. Unless a separate stay of the decision is requested and granted (see Chapter 2, section 23(M)), the licensee may proceed with an approved project pending the outcome of the appeal. Any activity initiated in accordance with the approved license during the pendency of the appeal comes with the risk of not knowing the outcome of the appeal, including the possibility that the decision may be reversed or modified by the Board.
- 4. Alternative dispute resolution. If the appeal participants agree to use mediation or another form of alternative dispute resolution ("ADR") to resolve the appeal and so notify the Board, the Board will not hear the matter until the conclusion of that effort, provided the participants engaged in the alternative dispute resolution demonstrate satisfactory progress toward resolving the issues. See Chapter 2, section 23(H) or contact the Board Executive Analyst (contact information below) for more information on the ADR provision.

WHAT TO EXPECT ONCE YOU FILE A TIMELY APPEAL WITH THE BOARD

The Board will acknowledge receipt of each appeal and develop a service list of appeal participants and any interested persons for use in the appeal proceeding. Electronic mail (e-mail) is the preferred method of communication during an appeal proceeding; however, the Board reserves the right to require paper copies of all filings. Once the Board Chair rules on the admissibility of all proposed supplemental evidence, the licensee (if the licensee is not the appellant) may respond to the merits of the appeal. Instructions specific to each appeal will be provided in correspondence from the Board Executive Analyst or Board Chair. Generally, once all filings in an appeal proceeding are complete, the DEP staff will assemble a packet of materials for the Board (Board packet), including a staff recommendation in the form of a proposed Board Order. Once available, appeal participants will receive a copy of the Board packet and an agenda with the meeting location and start time. Once finalized, the meeting agenda will be posted on the Board's webpage https://www.maine.gov/dep/bep/index.html. Appeals will be considered based on the administrative record on appeal and oral argument at a regular meeting of the Board. See Chapter 2, Section 23(I). The Board may affirm all or part of the decision under appeal; affirm all or part of the decision under appeal with modifications, or new or additional conditions; order a hearing to be held as expeditiously as possible; reverse the decision under appeal; or remand the decision to the Commissioner or State Fire Marshal, as applicable, for further proceedings.

II. JUDICIAL APPEALS

The filing of an appeal with the Board is not a prerequisite for the filing of a judicial appeal. Maine law generally allows aggrieved persons to appeal final license decisions to Maine's Superior Court (*see* 38 M.R.S. § 346(1); Chapter 2; 5 M.R.S. § 11001; and M.R. Civ. P. 80C). A judicial appeal by a party to the underlying proceeding must be filed with the Superior Court within 30 days of receipt of notice of the Board's or the Commissioner's decision. For any other aggrieved person, an appeal must be filed within 40 days of the date the decision was rendered. An appeal to court of a license decision regarding an expedited wind energy development, a general permit for an offshore wind energy demonstration project, or a general permit for a tidal energy demonstration project may only be taken directly to the Maine Supreme Judicial Court. *See* 38 M.R.S. § 346(4), the Maine Administrative Procedure Act, statutes governing a particular license decision, and the Maine Rules of Civil Procedure for substantive and procedural details applicable to judicial appeals.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

If you have questions or need additional information on the appeal procedure, for administrative appeals contact the Board Clerk at clerk.bep@maine.gov or 207-287-2811 or the Board Executive Analyst at bill.hinkel@maine.gov or 207-314-1458, or for judicial appeals contact the court clerk's office in which the appeal will be filed.

Note: This information sheet, in conjunction with a review of the statutory and rule provisions referred to herein, is provided to help a person to understand their rights and obligations in filing an administrative or judicial appeal, and to comply with notice requirements of the Maine Administrative Procedure Act, 5 M.R.S. § 9061. This information sheet is not intended to supplant the parties' obligations to review and comply with all statutes and rules applicable to an appeal and insofar as there is any inconsistency between the information in this document and the applicable statutes and rules, the relevant statutes and rules apply.